



The Education Trust—Midwest

# TALENT MATTERS

SUPPORTING EQUITY AND MICHIGAN'S EDUCATORS FOR PANDEMIC RECOVERY AND BEYOND



*DISTRICT LEADERS SAY SCHOOL FUNDING INEQUITIES PRESENT THE GREATEST BARRIER TO OFFERING HIGHER SALARIES AND RETAINING TEACHER TALENT. THESE INEQUITIES ARE CONTRIBUTING TO A GROWING TALENT CRISIS FOR MICHIGAN'S UNDER-RESOURCED DISTRICTS.*

# TALENT MATTERS

## KEY TAKEAWAYS

- Many participating leaders estimate a \$10,000 salary gap in their districts' ability to attract the talent they want most in their schools.
- District leaders said school funding inequities present the greatest barrier to offering higher salaries and retaining teacher talent. Salary freezes, enduring legacy debt payments, undercompensating for additional responsibilities, and lack of retirement security also contribute to retention challenges in historically under-resourced districts.
- A salary boost for new teachers does not address the challenge of retaining experienced teachers within underserved districts, which costs even more for districts to remain competitive.
- While some districts have found ways to increase teacher salary or provide enticing compensation packages through external funding, these means are not sustainable long-term.
- District leaders with salaries they deemed competitive to other local districts did not believe their district's salaries compensated teachers enough given their job expectations, nor believed teacher salaries were competitive in larger job markets.

*By Dr. Tabitha Bentley, Director of Policy and Research & Riley Stone, Data and Policy Analyst*

Educator talent has long been a challenge in Michigan's highest poverty districts and districts serving high percentages of Black and Brown students. These districts have confronted enduring challenges in recruiting, retaining, and compensating highly effective and diverse educators, and this is reflected in outcomes such as teacher turnover rates.

A recent analysis, leveraging data from before the pandemic, found that "in schools with a teacher turnover rate of 30% or more, nearly three quarters of the students were from low-income families in 2018-19".<sup>1</sup> Moreover, Black students, whom only account for 18% of the statewide student enrollment, make up 45% of enrollment in schools where teachers were most likely to leave.<sup>2</sup>

Research also shows that this persistent talent turnover has a negative effect on student achievement in math and English language arts.<sup>3</sup>

**We heard from leaders in historically-underserved districts that face deeply-rooted structural challenges to hear their thoughts and concerns on what Michigan must do to attract, support and retain the teachers they want most in their schools.**

***Now, more than ever, we need to focus Michigan's educator talent conversation with equity at the center.***

# Educator Talent as a Critical Resource for Education Equity

On March 16, 2020, Governor Whitmer ordered the closure of all Michigan K-12 school buildings in effort to slow the spread of the COVID-19 virus.<sup>4</sup>

This 14-day halt in instruction was followed by an unprecedented shift in public education, where more students were learning remotely behind computers than in actual school buildings. Now a year later, many students still have not entered school buildings for instruction all year.<sup>5</sup>

While the full impact of the pandemic's disruption on education is unclear, what we do know is the effect will be felt widely across the field, including by one of our most valuable assets: educators.

The pandemic gave families and the world at large a front row seat in witnessing many teachers making heroic efforts to move traditional face-to-face instructional practices to digital platforms, and tirelessly working to support students during these unprecedented times. This crisis also magnified the critical importance of educators and the invaluable roles teachers fill as the lynchpins in our education system. Research has long demonstrated that teachers, and effective teaching in particular, are the number one in-school predictor of student learning and success in the classroom.<sup>6</sup>

In this brief, we highlight the perspectives of district leaders working in high-poverty districts in Michigan at the height of the pandemic. Our conversations revealed a key theme: Michigan is not doing enough to meet the needs of teachers in high poverty schools and districts, nor enough to meet the needs of district leaders working to attract, retain, and develop them.

## WE'RE LISTENING

This year, The Education Trust-Midwest will be launching a new series on educator talent and equity.

Our first step in that work was to listen to leaders in districts that face deeply-rooted structural challenges and are historically-underserved to hear their thoughts and concerns about what Michigan must do to attract, support and retain top talent.

### About Our Interviews

We spoke to a total of 22 Michigan school district leaders through structured interviews. (See appendix A for details on each district). Twenty of these leaders were local school district superintendents or assistant superintendents.

All leaders were working in urban and rural schools with higher than state average student populations for at least one of our priority populations, including students of color, students living in poverty, students with disabilities, and English Learner students.

***While the full impact of the pandemic's disruption on education is unclear, what we do know is the effect will be felt widely across the field, including by one of our most valuable assets: educators.***

# Why Now: Equity and Educator Talent

It is clear that Michigan must focus on talent not only to accelerate post-pandemic educational recovery, but also to address longstanding fractures in the educator talent pipeline. Recent Michigan data also signals that Michigan's talent crisis may get worse due to increased mid-year retirements and burnout.

Yet educator talent has long been a challenge in Michigan's highest poverty districts and districts serving high percentages of Black and Brown students. These districts have confronted enduring challenges in recruiting, retaining, and compensating highly effective and diverse educators, and this is reflected in outcomes such as teacher turnover rates.

A recent analysis, leveraging data from before the pandemic, found that "in schools with a teacher turnover rate of 30% or more, nearly three quarters of the students were from low-income families in 2018-19".<sup>7</sup> Moreover, Black students, whom only account for 18% of the statewide student enrollment, make up 45% of enrollment in schools where teachers were most likely to leave.<sup>8</sup>

As these districts now work toward recovery from the pandemic, highly effective teachers will be vitally important, especially as studies estimate that some historically underserved groups, such as students of color, could lose six to 12 months of learning by June 2021 on average.<sup>9</sup>

**Now, more than ever, we need to focus Michigan's educator talent conversation with equity at the center.**

## District Leaders Weigh In on Talent Challenges

The leaders with whom we spoke underscored that compensation serves as a key lever for impacting equitable access to talent, particularly in high-poverty districts.

Some key findings included:

- Many participating leaders estimate a \$10,000 salary gap in their districts' ability to attract the talent they want most in their schools.
- They acknowledge that teacher salaries are overall too low, and that this is a factor impacting teacher turnover.
- Some district leaders are using benefits other than educator salaries to help reduce turnover and shield vulnerable students from the impacts of turnover.

## Transparent Data to Support Equity In Talent

Michigan must prioritize collecting and reporting high-quality data about teacher compensation and salary. This critical first step will help shine a light on the salary gaps that often result in districts serving higher percentages of low-income students and students of color with fewer resources to attract and retain top talent. School funding inequities, salary freezes, and district legacy debts are among some of the reasons for these salary gaps.

Having honest and transparent information at the state level about educator salary will empower policymakers, education leaders, parents, advocates – and educators themselves – to better understand compensation across the state and develop targeted, equity-focused policies and investments to address Michigan's educator talent equity crisis.

# CLOSING COMPETITIVE SALARY GAPS

## What District Leaders Need Us to Know:

Many participating district leaders estimated they would need to increase teacher entry salaries by at least \$10,000 to attract the teachers they want most to their schools, and more money would be needed to retain them.

## FINDINGS:

Teachers' pay can have substantial influence on where a teacher decides to teach. Many studies indicate that increased pay – including salary increases, bonuses, loan alleviation and other forms of compensation – improves teacher retention alongside improvements in working conditions and effective school leadership.<sup>10</sup> Improving these factors also increases the likelihood of hiring effective educators.<sup>11</sup> Yet already, school systems, especially high-poverty districts, are at a disadvantage when it comes to teacher pay.

In our recent report, "*The Urgency of Now: Michigan's Education Recovery*," a statewide analysis showed a \$10,000 pay gap in average teacher salaries between Michigan's wealthiest and poorest districts.<sup>12</sup>

Consequently, we wanted to hear directly from district leaders in higher poverty districts on how they are experiencing teacher salary inequity. Leaders we interviewed said that remaining competitive in compensation relative to other districts was a key part of their budgetary process when determining teacher salary levels. Yet for many district leaders in under-resourced schools and communities, it's difficult to stay competitive.

The first-year teacher starting salaries in the Michigan districts we interviewed ranged from \$35,000 to \$51,000. When asked an open-ended question of how much teacher salaries would need to change for their district to be competitive, eleven of 22 districts indicated an estimated \$10,000 increase in entry salary would be needed to attract the teachers they wanted most in their schools.



## WHAT THEY SAID

"Our salaries need to go up at least \$7,000 to \$10,000 in order to keep and retain our teachers. \$32,000 was the starting salary when I came... We can't afford to go up that amount of money right now." (Hazel Park Schools)

"How long can you give a teacher \$40,000 to \$45,000 to \$50,000 with the hope of attracting him/her from a Grand Blanc, Flushing, or a Carman[-Ainsworth] district? How do we get a teacher that may not have to work as hard in another district not facing the barriers to learning we do; and make more money than they would here on top of that?" (Bendle Public Schools)

Some districts have found creative – but often unsustainable -- ways to supplement their budgets to make teachers' salaries more competitive. Districts like Grand Rapids Public Schools and Battle Creek Public Schools secured private funding for incentives such as signing bonuses for bilingual teachers and more competitive compensation packages.

Other districts have worked to prioritize teacher salaries after years of lagging behind. For instance, after many years of devastating budget constraints and state financial oversight, Detroit Public Schools Community District made headlines last year when it became the highest paying district for first-year teachers in metro Detroit.<sup>13</sup>

Even so, district leaders acknowledge the limitations of additional external funding, and recognize more is still needed to retain experienced teachers.



## WHAT THEY SAID

"The long-term sustainability of those [compensation] incentives is not there... Our saving grace has been a grant." (Battle Creek Public Schools)

"We have a lot of teachers that are at the top of our scale right now, and we will be prepared when those individuals eventually retire. Yet due to the current funding model, it costs more to increase those top salaries, so we have been creative with one-time bonuses as we work to try and keep our veteran teachers' total compensation competitive." (Detroit Public Community School District)

Moreover, districts leaders who believe their salaries are competitive to surrounding districts don't believe teachers are compensated enough given what's expected of them.

Some also identified that salaries in the teaching profession weren't comparable to other professions, making districts less competitive in larger job markets and confirming recent research of a teacher compensation penalty, in which public school teachers earn less in weekly wages than non-teacher college graduates.<sup>14</sup>

"Don't mistake what I'm saying when I say the pay is competitive. I don't think it's enough. I think that teachers should all make way more than what we're paying them, even first year teachers, because the expectation of them is so great." (Northridge Academy)

"Whether I'm talking about a public-school academy like ours or a traditional public school, the pay scale and the benefits have not kept pace with the private sector." (Battle Creek Area Learning Center)

"Yes, we're very competitive with our neighbors in terms of salary. But that's not the real picture. The picture is we're not competitive with other fields and people are not choosing to come into education." (South Redford School District)



## TO THE POINT

- Many participating district leaders agreed that they'd need to increase teacher entry salaries by at least \$10,000 to attract the teachers they want most in their schools.
- A salary boost for new teachers does not address the challenge of retaining experienced teachers within underserved districts, which costs even more for districts to remain competitive.
- While some districts have found ways to increase teacher salary or provide enticing compensation packages through external funding, these means are not sustainable long-term.
- District leaders with salaries they deemed competitive to other local districts did not believe their district's salaries compensated teachers enough given their job expectations, nor believed teacher salaries were competitive in larger job markets. Their experiences align with recent research highlighting teachers earn less in weekly pay than other non-teacher college graduates.<sup>15</sup>

*"Whether I'm talking about a public-school academy like ours or a traditional public school, the pay scale and the benefits have not kept pace with the private sector."  
(Battle Creek Area Learning Center)*

# BARRIERS TO OFFERING HIGHER SALARIES AND OVERALL TEACHER RETENTION

## What District Leaders Need Us to Know:

District leaders said school funding inequities present the greatest barrier to offering higher salaries and retaining teacher talent. Salary freezes, undercompensating for additional responsibilities, and lack of retirement security also contribute to retention challenges in historically under-resourced districts.

## FINDINGS:

Historically, the state of Michigan has drastically underfunded its public education system, especially much needed support for the additional needs of students in underserved groups.<sup>16</sup> In fact, Michigan ranks in the bottom five states nationally for funding gaps between the highest and lowest poverty districts, which negatively impacts students from low-income families.<sup>17</sup>

District leaders in higher-poverty schools serving higher populations of students with additional needs are painfully aware of this reality. Nearly half of the district leaders we spoke to acknowledged that the talent challenges they faced were deeply rooted in Michigan's inequitable school funding system at large.

Several noted that the system does not equitably fund their districts according to students' needs. Others said the state's per-pupil foundation allowance – or the base state dollar amount they receive per student -- does not adequately fund basic needs such as providing teachers with appropriate salaries. Leaders affirmed that inequitable and inadequate funding leaves teachers, especially teachers in high-poverty schools, without the critical resources they need to be effective in their classrooms. Moreover, leaders spoke of how school funding inequities exacerbated teacher turnover, especially as wealthier near-by districts are able to offer higher teacher salaries to teachers that have built their experience in higher-poverty schools.



## WHAT THEY SAID

"It really starts with equitable funding for school districts. If we were funded at the same levels as some of our suburban counterparts...we would have a lot more money that we would be able to pour into teacher salaries..." (Detroit Public Schools Community District)

"We do see a lot of folks start here with us, that we train up, and I'm just going to name it for what it is, and then they leave us to go to districts that are not as Black and Brown as us, and that are not as socioeconomically disadvantaged as us...So that's tough because we train them up really good and we invest in our staff and then they leave us." (Orchard View Schools)

Beyond inequities in the state's funding structure, districts also identified salary freezes as another barrier to offering higher salaries and overall teacher retention, especially in high-poverty districts. Salary freezes and debt payments had prevented some districts from not only offering higher salaries, but also incentivized teachers to find employment where their years of experience would be fully rewarded. These challenges were most commonly connected to districts with legacy debt accrued from district consolidations, emergency loans and management, and prior troubling financial times.<sup>18</sup>

Many participating leaders said the salary ranges they offer teachers based on their experience, also called a salary schedule, sometimes would not change for several years in a row. Too often, that left teachers at the same levels – also called “steps” – for several years.



## WHAT THEY SAID

“In the middle of the year we gave 3% raises which finally took our salary schedule back to the original salary schedule from six years ago, but it has not been increased for 20 years in Hazel Park.” (Hazel Park Schools)

“When I came to Battle Creek Public Schools about five years ago, the [salary] steps had been frozen for teachers for many years. You could be a 15-year veteran teacher at step nine. I think it was even longer for some. For many teachers, it was a better option to transfer to another district that was going to recognize your years of service leaving our high-needs district in a position to constantly staff with less experienced teachers.” (Battle Creek Public Schools)

“About \$100 million is still owed as debt payments from our consolidation, in addition to \$10 million owed to the treasury which comes directly from state aid payments. People only see the bonds that we pay, but they forget we have that additional payment that comes straight out of state aid. It’s taken away before we even get our money in, and unless that legacy debt is ever removed we can’t be in a [better] situation.” (Ypsilanti Community Schools)

Several leaders acknowledged that the additional responsibilities, such as informally counseling students and afterschool programming, can detract from the appeal of the teaching profession. These additional responsibilities, if placed upon teachers, should also come with additional compensation. Having no retirement plan or poor retirement options also prevented many participating district leaders from retaining talent.



## WHAT THEY SAID

“The counseling resources and other supports that students need -- teachers don’t have the time in their day to be able to address those... The other piece is doing some more after school programming.” (Fennville Public Schools)

“The result of [emergency management and charter status funding] is that we operate on a tighter budget. My teachers are not a part of the State Retirement System. And we experienced 50% turnover of our staff in the first seven years of the system - 50%. Yet with strategic initiatives, including substantial grant funding to increase salaries and other initiatives to support teachers’ success in the classroom, our current retention rate is 95% over the past 21 months.” (Muskegon Heights Public School Academy System)

*“It really starts with equitable funding for school districts. If we were funded at the same levels as some of our suburban counterparts...we would have a lot more money that we would be able to pour into teacher salaries...” (Detroit Public Schools Community District)*

## ! TO THE POINT

- School funding inequity impedes district leaders' ability to offer higher salaries to teachers. This is a significant and familiar issue for leaders in historically under-resourced districts that serve high populations of students from low-income backgrounds and students with additional needs.
- Salary freezes prevent districts from offering higher salaries, and freezes are often connected to districts struggling with legacy debt. Participating leaders who were managing district legacy debts recognized that state leadership is needed to directly address and alleviate debts so their districts could be in better financial standing to provide higher salaries to teachers.
- Other common barriers to higher salaries and teacher retention include under-compensation for additional responsibilities and poor or no retirement offerings.

# SHIELDING VULNERABLE STUDENTS FROM THE IMPACT OF TURNOVER

### What District Leaders Need Us to Know:

Many district leaders recognize that talent turnover disproportionately impacts vulnerable students, and they often resort to using benefits other than educator salaries to try to help reduce turnover. District leaders also recognize the importance of educator diversity alongside improving teacher leadership pathways.

### FINDINGS:

Lack of educator support can and has led to alarming trends when attracting, retaining and developing effective educators.<sup>19</sup> Concerningly, high rates of teacher turnover disproportionately impact Michigan's most vulnerable students.<sup>20</sup> Research also shows that this persistent talent turnover has a negative effect on student achievement in math and English Language arts.<sup>21</sup>

We are encouraged by the initiative included in Michigan's FY21 state budget to provide retention stipends for new teachers, with the highest stipends made available for new teachers in high-poverty districts.<sup>22</sup> While this is a step in the right direction, the district leaders we interviewed highlighted the persistence and impact of talent turnover in their schools.

In particular, district leaders recognized the severe impact that educator turnover and talent have on relationship building, student trust, and instruction. Research underscores the importance of engaging students' and family's identities and backgrounds, as well as building environments of respect and trust to support student learning and positive socio-emotional outcomes.<sup>23</sup>

*"About \$100 million is still owed as debt payments from our consolidation, in addition to \$10 million owed to the treasury which comes directly from state aid payments. People only see the bonds that we pay, but they forget we have that additional payment that comes straight out of state aid. It's taken away before we even get our money in, and unless that legacy debt is ever removed we can't be in a [better] situation." (Ypsilanti Community Schools)*



## WHAT THEY SAID

"We've had people coming and going all the time. So, the under-developed and unformed relationships, the lack of trust - all of that starts to make sense when you looked at that teacher turnover." (Muskegon Heights Public School Academy System)

"If you keep losing teachers because you can't pay teachers equitably, you will have poor or low-quality instruction as a result. Guess what? It's systemic. The issue of teacher pay is not going to go away. The state plays a key role in cultivating and developing a climate where teacher pay remains at the forefront of the educational process. If not, we will not have a strong system where teachers will want to come and stay." (Hope Academy)

"It takes about... five years for teachers to really understand that grade level, that craft, the pedagogy, and get that strong skill set...They're here three years, four, and then they get recruited [elsewhere]." (Ypsilanti Community Schools)

Some districts have already attempted to put a variety of programs in place to try to encourage teachers to stay. These strategies range from bolstering local teacher pipelines to augmenting benefits such as retirement, healthcare, vacation or insurance. Many districts leaders we spoke to were willing to implement programs to shield students from the impact of teacher turnover and reap the benefits that come with retaining teachers in their respective schools.



## WHAT THEY SAID

"We launched the Academy of Teaching and Learning, which is a grow our own campaign; [The program] has a direct pipeline where if kids graduate, they're guaranteed a slot at the Ferris State University College of Education. And if they graduate meeting certain criteria, they get first dibs at a job back with GRPS." (Grand Rapids Public Schools)

"We've had to do our own part to build a better pipeline into the teaching profession. On the Rise Academy is our district-led alternative certification program for individuals who have held careers in our schools but not as a certified teacher. It's a grow your own model that will help sustain our pool of eligible teachers particularly with our own employees who are often from the city and are graduates of our district." (Detroit Public Schools Community District)

"We've increased the vacation days - they get a week's vacation, most districts in our area are three days. Insurance-wise, we provide them as much as the state allows us." (Saranac Community Schools)

"We do offer a 401(k) and we can match to a certain degree... We also pay 100% of our staff insurance, and 50% of their family benefit." (Richfield Public School Academy)

Prioritizing educator talent and ensuring all students have access to highly effective educators by improving professional development, feedback and support systems is critical for student success. Efforts are also needed to ensure access to a culturally and racially diverse teacher workforce. District leaders recognized the importance of educator diversity alongside improving teacher leadership pathways.



## WHAT THEY SAID

"We're trying very hard to attract a diverse teaching pool; so how are we prepared for a more diverse teaching pool? ... The worst thing I'd like to do is have this intentional effort to include diverse talent, but yet not have a culture that's inclusive of that value so [we] prepare for that as well." (Godfrey-Lee Public Schools)

"...Our struggle is in our relationships with higher education and creating a diverse workforce, we need more support with that. We want to make sure that our workforce mirrors the population of students that they teach and it does not." (Battle Creek Community Schools)



## TO THE POINT

- Teacher turnover disproportionately impacts historically underserved student groups in Michigan and has a direct impact on building relationships, student trust, and quality instruction.
- A variety of strategies such as creating local teacher pipelines and augmenting benefit packages have been used to support districts' talent challenges and shield students from turnover impact. Yet, continued guidance, support and resources are needed to expand and enhance these strategies.
- Other means to shield vulnerable students from the impact of turnover include prioritizing educator diversity and improving teacher leadership pathways.

## CONCLUSION

Addressing educator talent is imperative towards supporting Michigan students' academic recovery and urgently requires a comprehensive, statewide plan that puts equity at the forefront.

Recent national survey findings suggest that among teachers who either resigned, retired early or took unpaid leave due to the COVID-19 pandemic, a majority (64%) left because they were not paid enough to merit the risks or stress of teaching.<sup>24</sup> From our interviews with district leaders, compensation remains a major challenge to attracting and retaining top talent, especially in high-poverty districts.

Michigan's inequitable school funding structure is at the root of many resource inequities, including acting as a barrier to offering higher salaries in high-poverty districts. Districts that serve primarily students from low-income backgrounds, students of color and students with additional needs identified this as a consistent issue.

Several district leaders that we interviewed highlighted the need to increase teachers' entry salaries by at least \$10,000 to address inadequate salaries that lead to teacher attrition and turnover. They also highlighted the need for additional funding needs for retaining experienced teachers in underserved districts.

Furthermore, salary freezes, legacy debts, under-compensation for additional responsibilities and poor retirement offerings all exacerbate teacher turnover and inadequate salaries in historically under-resourced districts. If these inequities continue, there will be an enduring impact on relationship building, student trust and instruction.

District leaders have begun to implement a variety of creative strategies to address talent challenges and shield students from the impact of teacher turnover, ranging from bolstering local teacher pipelines to augmenting benefits.

However, the patchwork design built from an inequitable system is not enough to shield underserved students completely. Further guidance, support and equitable resources are needed to expand and strengthen these strategies to ensure student achievement and wellbeing.

***Addressing educator talent is imperative towards supporting Michigan students' academic recovery and urgently requires a comprehensive, statewide plan that puts equity at the forefront.***

---

## End Notes

[1] Koby Levin and Gabrielle LaMarr LeMee, "High Teacher Turnover is Hurting Michigan's Most Vulnerable Students," *Chalkbeat*, March 2021. [https://projects.chalkbeat.org/teacher-movement/index.html?\\_ga=2.204804240.1498255773.1616957371-2143083438.1610301370#/](https://projects.chalkbeat.org/teacher-movement/index.html?_ga=2.204804240.1498255773.1616957371-2143083438.1610301370#/)

[2] Ibid

[3] Matthew Ronfeldt, Susanna Loeb and James Wyckoff, "How Teacher Turnover Harms Student Achievement," (Washington, D.C.: National Center for Analysis of Longitudinal Data in Education Research, January 2012). <https://cepa.stanford.edu/sites/default/files/TchTrnStAch%20AERJ%20RR%20not%20blind.pdf>

[4] State of Michigan, Coronavirus - Governor Whitmer Announces Statewide Closure of All K-12 School Buildings; School Building Closures Will Last Monday, March 16 Through Sunday, April 5. Retrieved from <https://www.michigan.gov/coronavirus/0,9753,7-406-98163-521561--,00.html>

[5] Tabitha Bentley and Riley Stone, "Underserved Students More Likely to be Learning Remotely, Even as More Districts Provided In-person Learning Options," *The Education Trust-Midwest*, April 2021. <https://midwest.edtrust.org/2021/04/15/underserved-students-more-likely-to-be-learning-remotely-even-as-more-districts-provided-in-person-learning-options/?emci=0069c4e8-fd9d-eb11-85aa-0050f237abef&emdi=10ddb425-049e-eb11-85aa-0050f237abef&ceid=379756>

[6] William Sanders and June Rivers, "Cumulative and Residual Effects on Teachers on Future Student Academic Achievement," (Knoxville, TN: University of Tennessee, Value-Added Research and Assessment Center, November 1996). <https://www.beteronderwijsnederland.nl/files/cumulative%20and%20residual%20effects%20of%20teachers.pdf>; Steven G. Rivkin, Eric A. Hanushek and John F. Kain, "Teachers, Schools, and Academic Achievement," *Econometrica*, vol. 73 no. 2, March 2005, pp. 417-58. <https://econ.ucsb.edu/~jon/Econ230C/HanushekRivkin.pdf>

[7] Koby Levin and Gabrielle LaMarr LeMee, "High Teacher Turnover is Hurting Michigan's Most Vulnerable Students," *Chalkbeat*, March 2021. [https://projects.chalkbeat.org/teacher-movement/index.html?\\_ga=2.204804240.1498255773.1616957371-2143083438.1610301370#/](https://projects.chalkbeat.org/teacher-movement/index.html?_ga=2.204804240.1498255773.1616957371-2143083438.1610301370#/)

[8] Ibid

[9] Emma Dorn, Bryan Hancock, Jimmy Sarakatsannis, and Ellen Viruleg, "COVID-19 and Learning Loss- Disparities Grow and Students Need Help," (McKinsey & Company, December 2020). <https://www.mckinsey.com/industries/public-and-social-sector/our-insights/covid-19-and-learning-loss-disparities-grow-and-students-need-help>

[10] Denise-Marie Ordway, "Raising Public School Teacher Pay: What the Research Says," *The Journalist's Resource*, January 2020. <https://journalistsresource.org/studies/society/education/school-teacher-pay-research/>; Michael L. Hansen, Diana S. Lien, Linda C. Cavalluzzo, Jennie W. Wegner, "Relative Pay and Teacher Retention: An Empirical Analysis in a Large Urban District," (Alexandria, VA: The CNA Corporation, March 2004). <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED485516.pdf>; Eileen L. Horng, "Teacher Tradeoffs: Disentangling Teachers' Preferences for Working Conditions and Student Demographics," *American Educational Research Journal*, vol. 46 no. 3, September 2009, pp. 690-717. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40284859?seq=1>

[11] Denise-Marie Ordway, "Raising Public School Teacher Pay: What the Research Says," *The Journalist's Resource*, January 2020. <https://journalistsresource.org/studies/society/education/school-teacher-pay-research/>; Michael L. Hansen, Diana S. Lien, Linda C. Cavalluzzo, Jennie W. Wegner, "Relative Pay and Teacher Retention: An Empirical Analysis in a Large Urban District," (Alexandria, VA: The CNA Corporation, March 2004). <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED485516.pdf>

[12] Mary Grech, Tabitha Bentley, and Riley Stone, "The Urgency of Now: Michigan's Educational Recovery," (Royal Oak, MI: The Education Trust-Midwest, January 2021). [https://michiganachieves.com/wp-content/uploads/sites/2/2021/01/Education-Trust-Midwest\\_The-Urgency-of-Now-Michigans-Educational-Recovery\\_January-13-2021.pdf?emci=04862299-7756-eb11-a607-00155d43c992&emdi=cf4fabec-8056-eb11-a607-00155d43c992&ceid=401142](https://michiganachieves.com/wp-content/uploads/sites/2/2021/01/Education-Trust-Midwest_The-Urgency-of-Now-Michigans-Educational-Recovery_January-13-2021.pdf?emci=04862299-7756-eb11-a607-00155d43c992&emdi=cf4fabec-8056-eb11-a607-00155d43c992&ceid=401142)

[13] John Wisely, "Detroit Schools to Boost Starting Teacher Salaries by 33%," *Detroit Free Press*, May 2020. <https://www.freep.com/story/news/education/2020/05/21/detroit-schools-community-district-starting-teacher-salary/5235425002/>

[14] Sylvia Allegretto and Lawrence Mishel, "Teacher Pay Penalty Dips but Persists in 2019," (Washington, DC: Economic Policy Institute, September 2020). <https://www.epi.org/publication/teacher-pay-penalty-dips-but-persists-in-2019-public-school-teachers-earn-about-20-less-in-weekly-wages-than-nonteacher-college-graduates/>; Matt Barnum, "Why Teacher Pay Matters: Recruitment and Retention Can Improve Results," *The 74 Million*, August 2016. <https://www.the74million.org/article/why-teacher-pay-matters-recruitment-and-retention-can-improve-results/>

[15] Ibid

[16] David Arsen, Tanner Delpier and Jesse Nagel, "Michigan School Finance at the Crossroads: A Quarter Century of State Control," (Lansing, MI: Michigan State University, January 2019). <https://education.msu.edu/ed-policy-phd/pdf/Michigan-School-Finance-at-the-Crossroads-A-Quarter-Center-of-State-Control.pdf>

[17] Ivy Morgan, Reetchel Presume, Mary Grech and Ary Amerikaner, "Michigan's School Funding: Crisis and Opportunity," (Royal Oak, MI: The Education Trust-Midwest and Washington, D.C.: The Education Trust, January 2020). [https://michiganachieves.com/wp-content/uploads/sites/2/2020/01/Education-Trust-Midwest\\_Michigan-School-Funding-Crisis-Opportunity\\_January-23-2020-WEB.pdf](https://michiganachieves.com/wp-content/uploads/sites/2/2020/01/Education-Trust-Midwest_Michigan-School-Funding-Crisis-Opportunity_January-23-2020-WEB.pdf)

- [18] Chad Livengood, "Michigan Wrangles With School Debts", *The Detroit News*, April 2015. <https://www.detroitnews.com/story/news/education/2015/04/06/michigan-wrangles-school-debts/25344595/>
- [19] Jared Robinson and Brian Lloyd, "Teacher Turnover in Michigan: A Look at Teacher Mobility and Attrition Rates," (Lansing, MI: Michigan Department of Education, September 2017). [https://www.michigan.gov/documents/mde/Teacher\\_Mobility\\_Brief\\_Final\\_2017.09.18\\_v2\\_ada\\_601772\\_7.pdf](https://www.michigan.gov/documents/mde/Teacher_Mobility_Brief_Final_2017.09.18_v2_ada_601772_7.pdf)
- [20] Ibid
- [21] Matthew Ronfeldt, Susanna Loeb and James Wyckoff, "How Teacher Turnover Harms Student Achievement," (Washington, D.C.: National Center for Analysis of Longitudinal Data in Education Research, January 2012). <https://cepa.stanford.edu/sites/default/files/TchTrnStAch%20AER%20RR%20not%20blind.pdf>
- [22] State of Michigan Legislature, Public Act 165, September 2020.
- [23] The Danielson Group, "The Framework for Remote Teaching," (Chicago, IL: The Danielson Group, 2020). <https://www.k12.wa.us/sites/default/files/public/tpep/frameworks/danielson/The%20Framework%20for%20Remote%20Teaching%20doc.pdf>
- [24] Madeline Will, "Teachers Are Stressed Out, and It's Causing Some to Quit," *EducationWeek*, February 2021. <https://www.edweek.org/teaching-learning/teachers-are-stressed-out-and-its-causing-some-to-quit/2021/02>

## Appendix A. Interviewed District Demographics

District Name	Locale	School District Type	Total Enrollment	Economically Disadvantaged Enrollment	Black Enrollment	Latinx Enrollment	Native American or American Indian Enrollment	White Enrollment	Students with Disabilities Enrollment	English Learner Enrollment
Battle Creek Area Learning Center	City	Charter	171	81.87%	11.11%	9.94%	0.58%	64.91%	21.64%	0.58%
Battle Creek Public Schools	City	Traditional	3821	72.15%	38.26%	12.25%	0.42%	33.03%	17.48%	7.69%
Bay City School District	City	Traditional	7271	52.98%	3.86%	9.86%	0.63%	79.29%	13.89%	1.60%
Bendle Public Schools	Suburb	Traditional	1154	95.23%	8.06%	5.72%	0.52%	75.30%	14.90%	0.09%
Benton Harbor Area Schools	Suburb	Traditional	1776	97.35%	93.13%	2.42%	0.11%	1.13%	17.40%	1.58%
Comstock Public Schools	Suburb	Traditional	1754	71.61%	18.93%	8.67%	0.46%	57.92%	15.11%	3.19%
Detroit Public Schools Community District	City	Traditional	50895	81.50%	82.11%	13.67%	0.16%	2.47%	14.53%	11.41%
Fennville Public Schools	Rural	Traditional	1292	71.21%	1.08%	51.16%	0.00%	45.51%	9.52%	22.91%
Fruitport Community Schools	Suburb	Traditional	2667	53.24%	2.85%	6.07%	1.05%	85.23%	15.11%	1.20%
Godfrey-Lee Public Schools	City	Traditional	1818	95.16%	8.91%	79.26%	0.11%	7.81%	14.14%	50.06%
Grand Rapids Public Schools	City	Traditional	14557	80.11%	32.60%	39.02%	0.35%	19.75%	15.21%	27.57%
Hazel Park, School District of the City of	Suburb	Traditional	3076	69.47%	40.28%	3.25%	0.36%	51.01%	14.17%	6.21%
Hope Academy	City	Charter	501	91.02%	99.00%	0.80%	0.00%	0.20%	8.58%	0.00%
LifeTech Academy	City	Charter	257	49.03%	14.40%	11.67%	0.39%	66.93%	11.67%	0.00%
Muskegon Heights Public School Academy System	Suburb	Charter	606	94.55%	94.72%	0.66%	0.00%	3.47%	21.78%	0.00%
Northridge Academy	Rural	Charter	210	95.24%	94.29%	2.86%	0.48%	0.48%	13.33%	0.95%
Orchard View Schools	Rural	Traditional	2270	74.10%	18.59%	9.38%	0.66%	62.03%	16.04%	0.84%
Richfield Public School Academy	City	Charter	648	96.91%	63.27%	12.96%	0.31%	16.98%	19.60%	6.33%
Saranac Community Schools	Rural	Traditional	910	45.93%	1.32%	4.40%	0.44%	90.55%	14.84%	1.32%
South Redford School District	Suburb	Traditional	3118	63.92%	74.60%	3.72%	0.48%	14.53%	13.53%	2.37%
Sparta Area Schools	Rural	Traditional	2474	50.61%	1.74%	12.93%	0.40%	82.78%	16.05%	7.72%
Ypsilanti Community Schools	Suburb	Traditional	3858	72.03%	54.15%	9.77%	0.23%	22.40%	17.78%	8.37%
<b>Statewide Rate</b>			<b>1,499,552</b>	<b>51.08%</b>	<b>17.90%</b>	<b>8.25%</b>	<b>0.60%</b>	<b>65.28%</b>	<b>13.41%</b>	<b>6.27%</b>

Source: Michigan Department of Education, Student Count 2019-20